

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF DELAWARE**

IN RE GOOGLE INC. COOKIE  
PLACEMENT CONSUMER PRIVACY  
LITIGATION

Case No. 12-MD-2358 (JDW)

**[STIPULATED] ORDER RE:  
STANDARD FOR DISCOVERY,  
INCLUDING DISCOVERY OF  
ELECTRONICALLY STORED  
INFORMATION (“ESI”)**

This Document Relates to:  
**All Actions**

**1. Purpose.** This Order will govern discovery of electronically stored information (“ESI”) in this case as a supplement to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and any other applicable orders and rules.

**2. General Provisions.**

a. **Cooperation.** The parties are aware of the importance the Court places on cooperation and commit to cooperate in good faith throughout the matter.

b. **Proportionality.** Parties are expected to use reasonable, good faith and proportional efforts to preserve, identify and produce relevant information consistent with Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(1).<sup>1</sup> This includes identifying appropriate limits to discovery, including limits on custodians, identification of relevant subject matter, time periods for discovery and other parameters to limit and guide preservation and discovery issues.

c. **Preservation of Discoverable Information.** A party has a common law obligation to take reasonable and proportional steps to preserve discoverable information in the party's

---

<sup>1</sup> Information can originate in any form, including ESI and paper, and is not limited to information created or stored electronically.

possession, custody or control.

(i) Absent a showing of good cause by the requesting party, the parties shall not be required to modify, on a going-forward basis, the procedures used by them in the ordinary course of business to back up and archive data; provided, however, that the parties shall preserve the non-duplicative discoverable information currently in their possession, custody or control.

(ii) Absent a showing of good cause by the requesting party, the categories of ESI identified in Schedule A attached hereto need not be preserved.

**d. Privilege.**

(i) The parties are to confer on the nature and scope of privilege logs for the case, including whether categories of information may be excluded from any logging requirements and whether alternatives to document-by-document logs can be exchanged.

(ii) With respect to information generated after the filing of the first action consolidated into this MDL and any information in communications with and between a party's outside counsel, parties are not required to include any such information in privilege logs.

(iii) Activities undertaken in compliance with the duty to preserve information are protected from disclosure and discovery under Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(3)(A) and (B).

(iv) Parties shall confer on an appropriate non-waiver order under Fed. R. Evid. 502. Until a non-waiver order is entered, information that contains privileged matter or attorney work product shall be immediately returned if such information appears on its face to have been inadvertently produced or if notice is provided within 30 days of inadvertent production.

(iv) Nothing in this Agreement shall be interpreted to require disclosure of irrelevant information or relevant information protected by the attorney-client privilege, work-product doctrine, or any other applicable privilege or immunity. The parties do not waive any

objections to the production, discoverability, admissibility, or confidentiality of documents and ESI.

(v) Nothing in this Agreement shall be construed or interpreted as precluding a producing party from performing review and analysis to determine if a document is in fact relevant to the requesting party's request or is privileged or otherwise protected. Further, any document that is in good faith reasonably deemed not relevant to the requesting party's request, or is privileged or otherwise protected, may be withheld.

### **3. Specific E-Discovery Issues.**

a. **On-site inspection of electronic media.** Such an inspection shall not be permitted absent a demonstration by the requesting party of specific need and good cause.

b. **Search methodology.**

(i) If the producing party elects to use search terms to locate potentially responsive ESI, it shall disclose the search terms to the requesting party. Absent a showing of good cause, a requesting party may request no more than 10 additional terms to be used in connection with the electronic searches. Focused terms, rather than over-broad terms (e.g., product and company names), shall be employed. The parties shall meet and confer on any modifications to the proposed terms needed to improve their efficacy in locating discoverable information and in excluding information that is not discoverable under Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b), including modifying terms where the burden or expense of the proposed terms outweighs the likely benefit. The producing party shall search (i) the non-custodial data sources identified in the parties' initial disclosure; and (ii) emails and other ESI maintained by the custodians identified in the parties' initial disclosure.

(ii) Each party will use its best efforts to filter out common system files and

application executable files, including .bin format files and .p7s - P7S files which do not include human readable contents.

(iii) A party is required to produce only a single copy of a responsive document, and a party may de-duplicate responsive ESI across Custodians. A party may also de-duplicate email threads and attachments as follows: In an email thread, only the most evolved responsive email in a thread will be produced. Where an earlier-in-thread email has a responsive attachment not contained within the most evolved responsive email, the most evolved earlier-in-thread email containing the attachment will also be produced along with its attachment. An attachment is a file associated with an email for retention and storage as a single message unit.

c. **Format.** ESI and non-ESI shall be produced to the requesting party in the formats described in Schedule B. When a text-searchable image file is produced, the producing party must preserve the integrity of the underlying ESI, i.e., the original formatting, the metadata (as noted in Schedule B) and, where applicable (i.e., such as within a document management system (“DMS”)), the revision history. If particular documents warrant a different format, the parties will cooperate to arrange for the mutually acceptable production of such documents.

d. **Source Code and Logs.** No provision of this Order affects the inspection or production of source code and logs identified in Google’s Initial Disclosures.

#### **4. Modification.**

This Stipulated Order may be modified by a Stipulated Order of the parties or by the Court for good cause shown. Any such modified Stipulated Order will be titled sequentially as follows, “First Modified Stipulated Order re: Standard for Discovery, Including Discovery of Electronically Stored Information (“ESI”)” and each modified Stipulated Order will supersede the previous Stipulated Order.

IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

Dated: November 27, 2024

/s/ Brian Russell Strange

/s/ Anthony J Weibell

**Strange LLP**

Brian Russell Strange  
12100 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 1550  
Los Angeles, CA 90025  
brian@strangellp.com

**Mayer Brown LLP**

Anthony J Weibell  
Two Palo Alto Square, Suite 300  
Palo Alto, CA 94306  
(650) 331-2030  
aweibell@mayerbrown.com

*Executive Committee Member*

*Attorneys for Defendant Google LLC*

**PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED** on this \_\_\_\_ day of

\_\_\_\_\_, 2024.

---

Hon. Joshua D. Wolson

United States District Judge

## **SCHEDULE A**

1. Deleted, slack, fragmented, or other data only accessible by forensics.
2. Random access memory (RAM), temporary files, or other ephemeral data that are difficult to preserve without disabling the operating system.
3. On-line access data such as temporary internet files, history, cache, cookies, and the like, except with respect to information from the proposed class period on plaintiffs' devices. For avoidance of doubt, this item does not address any log data identified in Google's Initial Disclosures or code in Google's possession relating to the cookies at issue.
4. Data in metadata fields that are frequently updated automatically, such as last opened dates.
5. Back-up data that are substantially duplicative of data that are more accessible elsewhere.
6. Voice messages.
7. Instant messages that are not ordinarily printed or maintained in a server dedicated to instant messaging.
8. Electronic mail or pin-to-pin messages sent to or from mobile devices (e.g., iPhone and Blackberry devices), provided that a copy of such mail is routinely saved elsewhere.
9. Other electronic data stored on a mobile device, such as calendar or contact data or notes, provided that a copy of such information is routinely saved elsewhere.
10. Logs of calls made from mobile devices.
11. Server, system or network logs, except as identified in Google's Initial Disclosures.
12. Electronic data temporarily stored by laboratory equipment or attached electronic equipment, provided that such data is not ordinarily preserved as part of a laboratory report.
13. Data remaining from systems no longer in use that is unintelligible on the systems in use.

**SCHEDULE B**  
**PRODUCTION FORMAT AND METADATA**

1. **Production Components.** Productions shall include, single page TIFFs, Text Files, an ASCII delimited metadata file (.txt, .dat, or .csv) and an image load file that can be loaded into commercially acceptable production software (e.g., Concordance).
2. **Image Load File** shall contain the following comma-delimited fields: BEGBATES, VOLUME, IMAGE FILE PATH, DOCUMENT BREAK, FOLDER BREAK, BOX BREAK, PAGE COUNT.
3. **Metadata Fields and Metadata File.** Each of the metadata and coding fields set forth below that can be extracted shall be produced for each document. The parties are not obligated to populate manually any of the fields below if such fields cannot be extracted from a document, with the exception of the following: BEGBATES, ENDBATES, BEGATTACH, ENDATTACH, and CUSTODIAN. The metadata file shall be delimited according to the following characters:
  - Delimiter = ¶ (ASCII:020)
  - Text-Qualifier = þ (ASCII:254)
  - New Line = ® (ASCII:174)
  - Multi-Value Delimiter = ; (ASCII:059)

Field Name	Field Description
BEGBATES	Beginning Bates number as stamped on the production image
ENDBATES	Ending Bates number as stamped on the production image
BEGATTACH	First production Bates number of the first document in a family
ENDATTACH	Last production Bates number of the last document in a family
ALLCUSTODIANS	Includes the Individual (Custodian) from whom the documents originated and all Individual(s) whose documents de-duplicated out (De-Duped Custodian).
SUBJECT	Subject line of email
TITLE	Title from properties of document
DATESENT	Date and time email was sent (format: MM/DD/YYYY TIME)
TO	All recipients that were included on the “To” line of the email

FROM	The name and email address of the sender of the email
CC	All recipients that were included on the “CC” line of the email
BCC	All recipients that were included on the “BCC” line of the email
AUTHOR	Any value populated in the Author field of the document properties
FILENAME	Filename of an electronic document (Edoc or attachment)
DATEMOD	Date an electronic document was last modified or created (format: MM/DD/YYYY) (Edoc or attachment)
DATECREATED	Date the document was created (format: MM/DD/YYYY) (Edoc or attachment)
NATIVELINK	Native File Link (Native Files only)
TEXTLINK	Link to text files

4. **TIFFs.** Documents that exist only in hard copy format shall be scanned and produced as TIFFs. Unless excepted below, documents that exist as ESI shall be converted and produced as TIFFs. Unless excepted below, single page Group IV TIFFs should be provided, at least 300 dots per inch (dpi) for all documents. Each TIFF image shall be named according to a unique corresponding Bates number associated with the document. Each image shall be branded according to the Bates number and the agreed upon confidentiality designation. Original document orientation should be maintained (i.e., portrait to portrait and landscape to landscape). TIFFs shall show all text and images that would be visible to a user of the hard copy documents.
5. **Text Files.** A single multi-page text file shall be provided for each document, and the filename should match its respective TIFF filename. A commercially acceptable technology for optical character recognition “OCR” shall be used for all scanned, hard copy documents. When possible, the text of native files should be extracted directly from the native file. Text files will not contain the redacted portions of the documents and OCR text files will be substituted instead of extracted text files for redacted documents. All documents shall be produced with a link in the TextLink field.
6. **Image Load Files / Data Load Files.** Each TIFF in a production must be referenced in the corresponding image load file. The total number of documents referenced in a production’s data load file should match the total number of designated document breaks in the Image Load file(s) in the production. The total number of pages referenced in a



production's image load file should match the total number of TIFF files in the production. The total number of documents in a production should match the total number of records in the data load file.

7. **Bates Numbering.** All images must be assigned a unique Bates number that is sequential within a given document and across the production sets.
8. **Confidentiality Designation.** Responsive documents in TIFF format will be stamped with the appropriate confidentiality designations in accordance with the Protective Order in this matter. Each responsive document produced in native format will have its confidentiality designation identified in the filename of the native file.
9. **Redaction Of Information.** If documents are produced containing redacted information, an electronic copy of the original, unredacted data shall be securely preserved in such a manner so as to preserve without modification, alteration or addition the content of such data including any metadata therein.
10. **Native Files.** Spreadsheets (e.g., MS Excel, Google Sheets) and delimited text files (e.g. comma-separated value (.csv) files and tab-separated value (.tsv) files) shall be produced in either their native format or MS Excel. TIFF images need not be produced unless the files have been redacted, in which instance such files shall be produced in TIFF with OCR Text Files. A TIFF placeholder indicating that the document was provided in native format should accompany the database record. If a file has been redacted, TIFF images and OCR text of the redacted document will suffice in lieu of a native file and extracted text.
11. **Proprietary Files.** To the extent a response to discovery requires production of ESI accessible only through proprietary software, the parties should continue to preserve each version of such information. The parties shall meet and confer to finalize the appropriate production format.
12. **Production Media.** Documents shall be encrypted and produced on external hard drives, readily accessible computer(s) or other electronic media, or via FTP or other equivalent file transmittal application ("Production Media"). Each piece of Production Media shall identify a production number corresponding to the production volume (e.g., "VOL001," "VOL002"), as well as the volume of the material in that production (e.g. "-001," "-002"). Each piece of Production Media shall also identify: (1) the producing party's name; (2) the production date; (3) the Bates Number range of the materials contained on the Production Media; and (4) the set(s) of requests for production for which the documents are being produced.